

Foreign Policy Tools - India and Pakistan Face Off

Lesson Overview:

International events often require a response from the US State Department. In this lesson, students will study the latest conflict between India and Pakistan and decide which foreign policy tools are best suited for the situation. Next, students will write a persuasive speech to convince Secretary of State Marco Rubio what to do next.

Duration of the Lesson:

2 - 45 minute periods or 1 - 90 min

Materials List:

- Internet access and student tablets or computers (one per group is adequate)
- Projector with sound for video

Oregon 2024 Social Science Standards

Essential Disciplinary Practices:

II. Use chronological thinking skills, connecting the past with the present to recognize continuity and change in human history.

VI. Construct well-reasoned and logically coherent explanations, arguments, and solutions related to complex societal issues

VII. Cultivate global awareness and cultural understanding to effectively engage with diverse cultures and perspectives in an interconnected world.

Standards

6/7.G.HI.5 Identify and explain the consequences of cultural conflict, interaction, exchange, and/or fusion.

6/7.G.HE.7 Identify and describe examples of how conquest and colonialism affected traditionally underrepresented identities, cultures, and communities.

HS.C.IR.11 Identify and explain the roles and responsibilities of branches and agencies responsible for the foreign policy of the United States.

HS.C.DP.13 Argue and defend positions on contemporary issues in which foundational ideas or values are in tension.

HS.G.GR.1 Use geographic tools, various kinds of maps, and geospatial technologies to examine geographic components of past and current world events or to solve geographic problems.

HS.G.MM.4 Investigate and analyze the migration and settlement patterns of human populations, including the removal and segregation of communities in past and in current societies globally.

HS.G.HI.8 Identify examples of conflict and cooperation involving the use of land and natural resources.

Learning Objectives:

Students will be able to... (SWBAT)

- Use history to inform appropriate responses to current events
- Construct an argument, supported with evidence and reasoning
- Use rhetorical devices for persuasion

Essential Question:

How should the USA respond to the current conflict between India and Pakistan?

Procedure:

Time	Activity
Varies and will take place before this activity	Direct instruction - Teach the history of India-Pakistan relations. As a teacher, you can decide how to give the students adequate background knowledge to prepare them for this activity. You will know how long this will take and how much prior knowledge they have based on what you have already studied in the course. There are plenty of resources in CLP's Current Event: India and Pakistan: Nuclear Neighbors for you to use to get them ready.
10 min	<p>Hook: Tell students they will be pretending to be State Department officials working in teams to decide on a plan of action for US Secretary of State Marco Rubio to take regarding the current conflict between Pakistan and India. Put them in groups of 4-5. You will pretend to be Secretary Rubio, needing their recommendations.</p> <p>Next, show them this video which is an introduction to foreign policy tools: <i>Council on Foreign Relations Education: What Foreign Policy Tools Can Leaders Use?</i> https://youtu.be/gNKZN_yUIgU?si=Dfz8NrTC9Pgbk9Lu</p> <p>Have each group make a list of 'tools' the USA can use to influence what is happening in South Asia.</p>
15 min	Current Event time. Each group of students should read and watch the current event resources on the April 2025 terrorist attack and India's responses so they are up to speed on what has occurred so far.
20 minutes	<p>Group deliberations. Have students discuss what recommended foreign policy tools the USA's Sec. of State Marco Rubio should use to respond to this situation.</p> <p>This website has explanations of all the elements in the film with a bit more depth so they can study the options again. <i>Council on Foreign Relations Education: What Tools Do Foreign Policy Makers Have at Their Disposal?</i> https://education.cfr.org/learn/learning-journey/tools-foreign-policy/what-tools-do-foreign-policy-makers-have-at-their-disposal</p>
30 minutes	Pre-writing and Drafting final speech - Using the included student handouts, have student groups do the cloze prewriting. Check their work quickly and give oral feedback before giving them the green light to move on to the drafting phase.

15 minutes	Share out: Each group presents their recommendation to you (Rubio). You may ask them follow up questions to understand their reasoning.
Closing	Debrief: As Sec. Rubio, announce which plan of action was most persuasive to pursue at the present moment.

Assessment(s):

- Persuasive speeches

Modifications/Variations:

- You may assign different foreign policy tools to each group.
- Students could do recommendations and speech writing individually.

Lesson Recommendations:

- Do your best to find out if and how this topic is directly affecting any of your students so you can proceed with sensitivity.
- You may need to provide historical examples of successful and unsuccessful uses of the foreign policy tools.

Pre- writing Cloze: Persuasive Speech Version

Directions: Use this sheet to help your team write their recommendation.

Introduction:

- Thank you, Secretary Rubio, for allowing us to provide you with a recommended course of action regarding the conflict between Pakistan and India.

Context:

- Recent hostilities flared on _____ (time and place) when _____ (someone did something).
- That caused _____ (consequence), which _____ (another consequence or reaction).
- Now it's an issue because _____ (explain the problem).
- The United States should be concerned because _____ (why should we care?)

Evidence:

- Here's what we think we know about the issue:

- Here's what is still unknown about the issue:

Reasoning

- At this point, our team recommends _____ (what do you think should be done).
- Logical reasons for this course of action are _____ and _____.
- Experts in foreign policy like _____ say _____ which leads us to believe _____.
- Historically, _____ proved to be _____.
- From an ethical standpoint, we feel _____.

Counterpoint

- We recognize that others may say _____ because _____.
- However, the evidence shows that _____.

Call to Action

- In closing, we urge the United States to _____.

Drafting Your Speech

Once you have done some prewriting and research, you are ready to begin writing your speech. Read this advice on the essential parts of your speech then craft a first draft. Check with your teacher on the expected length of the speech so you know how long your draft needs to be.

Your goal: to persuade the audience to feel, think, or act in a particular way.

Introduction

- An effective introduction brings up an important topic, gives the background information and context of the issue, and lays out a very clear thesis statement.
- In deciding how much to educate the audience with the context, you'll need to walk a thin line between anticipating what the audience needs to know and not insulting them with a lecture.
- A thesis must claim something that reasonable people could disagree with (not a fact, but a debatable opinion).

Body

- A quality speech presents evidence and then explains how the evidence supports the thesis.
- Selecting convincing evidence from credible sources is essential.
- Leave out information you cannot confirm or that isn't helping the point you are trying to make.
- As you explain, try to use the three elements of persuasion: **ethos**, **pathos**, and **logos**. Get their attention, win over their hearts, then win over their minds.
 - Ethos - credibility of the speaker and sources
 - Pathos - emotions
 - Logos - logic and reasoning
- Anticipate the naysayers' counterpoints and show the flaws in their arguments before reiterating your own.

Conclusion

- A well organized speech ends with a conclusion that is built on a clear and solid foundation of Claim (thesis), Evidence (facts), and Reasoning (your analysis of the evidence) from the body of the speech.
- Sometimes, a conclusion can review the main points made in the speech to emphasize them.
- You will want to bring your thesis back to their attention, perhaps rephrased a bit for a lasting impression.
- You might decide to end with a call to action.